

## **Losing People Is Not Cheap, Organizations Pay Cost: A Context Of Private Schools In Pakistan.**

Muhammad Shahid Tufail<sup>\*</sup>, Ayesha Sharif<sup>†</sup> and Rabia<sup>‡</sup>

### **Abstract**

*This research is focused on getting the clearer view of the job satisfaction and quitting intention of the teachers in the private schools. The results show that employees' remuneration, flexible work life policies and the level of satisfaction influence the employees' turnover intentions. All private schools Dar-e- Arqam, City, Educator, Allied, Resource Academia , Spirit, smart, Fuji foundation, Bloomfield, knowledge, alpaina schools were visited to collect quantitative data through structured questionnaire with a sample of 300 private schools employees. Data was analyzed through correlation and multiple regressions with the help of (SPSS) software and the data conclusion were significant. The study indicates that nature of research is explanatory that measures the causal association between variables .The overall turnover intention in private schools is at the positive level. The finding suggests that the remuneration, supervisory support and work life policies has positive affect on the work satisfaction level that decrease the employees' intention to quit the private schools. This study was mainly under taken to investigate the importance of the different elements such as salary, flexible wok life policies and support of the supervisor for the employees. This study indicates a comprehensive diagnosis of turnover intention in private schools, the reasons of the dissatisfaction and recommendations to make them better them.*

**Keywords:** Turnover Intention, Remuneration, Supervisory support, Work life policies, Job satisfaction.

### **Introduction**

The main theme of this study is to search out the elements that become the reasons of satisfaction at job and turnover in the education sector in Pakistan. The research targets the effect of demographic factors on satisfaction at work and employees intention to leave the schools in the education sector. This study will investigate how to improve the job

---

<sup>\*</sup> Dr. Muhammad Shahid Tufail, Department of Management, Lyallpur Business School, Government College University, Faisalabad. Email: [mshahidtufail@gcuf.edu.pk](mailto:mshahidtufail@gcuf.edu.pk)

<sup>†</sup> Ayesha Sharif, Department of Marketing, Lyallpur Business School, Government College University Faisalabad.

<sup>‡</sup> Rabia, Department of Business, Administration, Government College University Faisalabad.

motivation to minimize the employee's turnover intention (Sangkh&Johri, 2007).

This study investigated the literature regarding remuneration, supervisory support, work life policies, employees turnover intention and job satisfaction generally and then specifically in the context of Pakistan to explore the literature gap. The literature is highly concerned with turnover intention in private schools and its relation with job satisfaction in the context of Pakistan is found to be non-existent. Secondly, the variables with the reference to this study are not used already as whole examined in the literature. That's why to cover these literature gaps in the field of turnover intention by exploring the association among the variables in the research.

Study used job satisfaction as a mediator in this study in relation to the independent variables (supervisory support, remuneration, work life policies) while dependent variable (Turnover intention). Before this no work was done in this context in the Pakistan. So it was necessary to work on this aspect to overcome the problems related to turnover intention.

The objective of this study includes:

- 1) To examine the relationship of remuneration and employee turnover intention at private school in Pakistan.
- 2) To study the relationship of supervisory support and employee turnover intention at private school in Pakistan.
- 3) To identify the relationship of and employee remuneration at private school in Pakistan.
- 4) To determine relationship of turnover intention and job satisfaction at private school in Pakistan.

The research questions of this study include:

- 1) What is relationship of remuneration and employee turnover intention at private school in Pakistan?
- 2) What is the relationship of supervisory support and employee turnover intention at private school in Pakistan?
- 3) What is the relationship of work life policies and employee turnover intention at private school in Pakistan?
- 4) What is the relationship of turnover intention and job satisfaction at private school in Pakistan?

### **Review of Literature**

#### **Remuneration**

It is the amount of money that is paid to a person for his work. In remuneration base salary is given without any incentive and bonus. The salary rate is not concerned with compensatory factors but it can lead to dissatisfaction (Wallace & Canninger, 2011). An employee who is happy

with his pay, surely it will increase the commitment level for the organization in which he or she offering his or her services .According to (Susi, 2011). According to Kopp, Fern and Budhwar (2013) Satisfaction with pay is inversely linked with workers intention to leave the organization.(Levona, 2010).

#### **Supervisory Support**

Supervisory support is the extent to which supervisory care their employees and give importance to their contribution. Employees and supervisors conflicts lead to the turnover intention (Houkes and Janssen, Jonge, and Nijhuis 2001). Working relationship of different kinds are costly, there could be many possibilities for it, strong association with coworkers were for graduates love their job and organization fell at the start of the career is very crucial. It is very crucial for the organizations to be aware of the social support and strong relationship with their employees that will increase their commitment for the organization. Supervisor should share information to his employees on regularly basis so it will work as two links for the organization and this action helps to build the employees trust for the organization. The findings indicate that positive relationship in job stress and presenteeism. Negative supervisory behavior highly influence with employee job stress related presenteeism. Age has a negative relationship with job stress related presenteeism (Gul, 2012).

#### **Work-Life Policies**

Work-life policies are programs that create balance between job demands and demands outside work. These factors have negatively associated with work satisfaction and organizational commitment (Sturman, 2012). Reconciliation of work at job and private life is in today's world is very crucial for the excessive workload and stress that will arise due to the following functions. Employees have a lot to do in a limited period of time they faced inflexible working hours at their jobs (Lewis & Cooper, 1987).

The results of this study show the cons of implementing work life practices for subordinate, their families, organization and social circle. While work life conflict becomes the reason of absenteeism, lack of engagement, low productivity, turnover rate and poor retention level (Lazar, 2010).

#### **Job Satisfaction**

Job satisfaction has positive impact on employee turnover intention (Peterson &Jrockett, 2009).It is defined as extent to which a person's expectation about the job that he is doing is fulfilled. Job satisfaction has indirect impact on turnover intention (Morries, 2010).According to (Susskind et al, 2000) mostly employees search for the new jobs and

compare them with current job and evaluate to get the alternative work. Job satisfaction has strongly opposite impact on employee turnover intention continuously (Kirschbaum, 2013).

### Turnover Intentions

Turnover intention deals with the employee's intention to the organization. It is negatively associated with loss of human assets and organizational performance (Brough, 2014).. Turnover intention is one step removed from actual turnover (Klassen, Cern and Gudhwar, 2013). (Nawagbara, 2013).

The results of this study indicated that there is direct impact of career satisfaction on employee's turnover intention and job satisfaction (Cho, 2012). Direct impact of employee engagement, human resources practices on turnover intentions (Chughtai, 2013).



Figure 1: Conceptual Framework

The present study remuneration, supervisory support, work life policies are independent variables which has positive influence on the turnover intention that is a dependent variable, at the same time job satisfaction positively influenced the variables that is the mediating variable in this theoretical framework, it mediate the association between the independent and dependent variable (Ahmad , 2015).

### Research Hypotheses

On the basis of previous studies the present study hypothesises that:

**H1:** There is a positive association of remuneration and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

**H2:** There is a positive association of supervisory support and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

**H3:** There is a positive relationship of work life policies and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

**H4:** job satisfaction mediates the relationship of remuneration and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

**H5:** job satisfaction mediates the relationship of supervisory support and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

**H6:** job satisfaction mediates the relationship of work life policies and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

### **Material and Methods**

#### **Research Philosophy**

Research reasoning is an applied research or phenomenological research that is concerned with sorted out data and investigates the courses of mindfulness and provides the impression of mindfulness (Brun, 2000).

#### **Research Approach**

Research methodology used deductive approach that move from general to specific and find out support or make amendments in a theory (Gulati, 2009).

#### **Research Nature**

Explanatory research also called causal research, the main purpose of it to test the hypothesis and check their cause and effect association between them. This study indicates that nature of research is explanatory that measures the causal association between variables (Malik, 2010)

#### **Research Process**

This research has used quantitative research technique because sample size is large; nature of analysis is statistical and collected through structured questionnaire (Feng, 2010).

#### **Research Strategy**

This section includes the sample size, study variables, analysis and sampling techniques, and research instrument and data collection process.

#### **Study Variable**

This study has three independent variables, one mediating variable and one dependent variable which are based on the literature. Supervisory support, work life balance polices and remuneration is independent variables while Job Satisfaction is mediating variable and turnover is the dependent variable.

#### **Unit of Analysis**

Unit analysis deals with “who and “what” are analyzing for research study. Unit of analysis were male and female teachers in private schools in Pakistan. The research reveals that young females are more interested in teaching profession (Posat, 2010).

#### **Target Population**

Target population was the teachers and coordinators in private schools in Pakistan. (Rekha, 2012).

### **Research Design**

In this research, cross sectional study design was used with an exploratory design. It means the information is to be collected only once (Stewart, 2001; Mallhota et al. 1996).

### **Research Instruments**

Adopted fully structured questionnaire was used in order to collect primary data. (Kolarova, 2010). Each variable with closed ended questions with various options assessed by five point Likert scale and this scale varied from 1 (Strongly Agree) to 5 (Strongly Disagree).

### **Sample Size**

The expected sample size was 350. Total 430 were floated for data gathering. Only 340 were received back 40 questionnaires from were unfilled and those questionnaires were not included. So, 300 questionnaires were properly filled.

### **Data Analysis Techniques**

The study is quantitative in nature and findings were gathered through questionnaire. The questionnaire survey adapted for data collection and total 350 responses tested in Statistical Package of Social Sciences (SPSS) for hypothesis testing and quantitative results. Descriptive statistics includes the analysis of the measures of central tendency, dispersion of independent and dependent variables, frequencies and variability of the data (Sekaran, 2004).

### **Instrument Validity and Reliability**

The Cronbach's Alpha was used to examine the internal consistency of all the variables in the study. The Cronbach's Alpha of remuneration was 0.843 and Supervisory Support was 0.737. Work life policies and job satisfaction has 0.726 and 0.809 Cronbach's Alpha respectively. All the variables have indicated an acceptable consistency ranging from 0.716 to 0.843.

### **Results and Discussion**

The results suggest the association among the variables of remuneration, supervisory support, work life policies, turnover intention and job satisfaction. Literature was referred to understand the main goal of the research and for those purpose earlier studies were used. The primary data was collected for independent, dependent and mediator variables with five point Likert scale. The collected data was assessed and evaluated by using the statistical software package for social sciences (SPSS version 21). Conclusion was drawn after in-depth analysis of findings of the study and the inter correlation was found between concerned variables respectively.

Table: 1 Correlation Matrix

	Correlation	1	2	3	4	5
1	Remuneration	1	0.621**	0.661**	0.793**	0.642**
2	Supervisory support		1	0.600**	0.576**	0.614**
3	Work life policies			1	0.612**	0.645**
4	Job satisfaction				1	0.665**
5	Turnover Intention					1

\*\*p < 0.01 p\* < 0.05

This table describes about the correlation between all the independent, mediating and dependent variables. Remuneration and supervisory support positively correlated with the values of (0.621, p<.01), it means that increase in the remuneration will also cause increase in Supervisory support. Supervisory support has positive relation with Work life policies that are positively associated with the value of (.600. p<.01). Job satisfaction has positive relationship with remuneration represented by the value of (.793, p<.01). Job satisfaction in addition has positive relation with Supervisory support with the value of (0.621, <.01).So, increase in the Job satisfaction leads to increase in remuneration and Supervisory support and work life policies. While Turnover intention has positive relation with job satisfaction by the value of (.0645, p<.01). The correlation matrix shows the relationship that exists among all the variables. Turnover intention has positive relation to remuneration, supervisory support, Work life policies and Job satisfaction represented by the value of 0.642\*\*, 0.614\*\*, 0.645\*\* and 0.665\*\* that shows an increase in one variable increase the other variable also.

Further implication was to increase the job satisfaction, remuneration, supervisory support and work life policies in the private schools. H1: There is a positive association of remuneration and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

Present study summed up six hypotheses on the basis of framework, after applying the Sobel test and significance and mediation of these hypothesis, we get the different results regarding mediation like full mediation, no mediation. On the basis of Sobel mediation test we accepted these hypotheses are significantly proven and showed full mediation.

Table :2 testing mediation

Sr#	Relationships	Direct effect	Direct effect with mediator	Results
1	R-JS -TO	.547(.000)	-.015(.883)	Full mediation
2	SS-JS-TO	.560(.000)	.614(.000)	No mediation
3	WLP-JS-TO	.653(.000)	-.023(.356)	Full mediation

R = remuneration, SS = supervisory support, WLP= Work life policies, JS= job satisfaction, TO= Turnover Intention

According to Mitsakis, (2014) remuneration is strongly associated with employees' intention to quit the private schools. Mostly high salary, pay scale and good benefits overcome the intention to leave the organization. Lee and Samon (2013) found a strong and positive relationship between remuneration and turnover intention of the employees. It showed full mediation. The results showed fully mediated results of H3: There is a positive relationship of work life policies and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab. According to Klassen, (2013) work life policies are strongly associated with employees' intention to quit the private schools. If the employees are offered flexible and relaxing working hours then they feel comfortable with organization and these factors overcome the employees' intention to leave the organization. Kim and Henry (2013) found a strong and positive relationship between work life policies and turnover intention of the employees. While in our context of study this hypothesis was proven wrong and rejected because results indicate no mediation.

H2: There is a positive association of supervisory support and employee turnover intention at private school in Punjab.

According to Takawira, (2010) supervisory support is associated with employees' intention to quit the private schools. If the employees are appreciated from their supervisors on their excellent performance and show them cooperation and support then they feel motivated and confidence with their supervisors and these factors reduced the employees' intention to leave the organization hence no mediation found in the given relationship.

Table :3 Regression Model Summary

Model	R	R <sup>2</sup>	F value	P-value
1	.940	.883	445.073	.000

This table shows the model summary of regression model. The R value is .940 and it shows that is p- value is .000 which implies it is significant model.

Table :4 Regression Table

Variables	Unstandardized Beta		Standard coefficient	t value	Sig.
	B	Standard error	$\beta$		
Turnover Intention	0.668	.057	.628	15.832	.000
Remuneration	0.461	.066	.591	14.986	.000
Supervisory Support	0.129	.031	.287	5.540	.000
Work life policies	0.717	.036	.713	17.883	.000

The simple regression model has been done and it shows that all the variables are significant as their fall under .05 (.000, .000, .000, .000, .000).

To check the significance of the mediating effect Barron and Kenny approach of mediation based on the procedure given by Sobel (1982), to carry out this procedure Sobel test is applied which is evolved by Preacher and Hayes (2004). Job satisfaction is acting as a mediator in relationship between independent variables (remuneration, supervisory support, work life policies) and dependent variable (Turnover intention). Results shows indirect effects of all variables are significant. According to sobel test remuneration has direct effect with mediator (.883>.000) so it shows full mediating effect of motivation, Supervisory support have direct effect with mediator (.000=.000) it shows no mediation, while Work life policies have direct effect with mediator (.356>.000) which proves full mediation.

Sobel test for testing the significance and mediation of the variables, in case of remuneration and turnover intention has the significance value (14.986) which had full mediation effect in relationship of supervisory support and turnover intention the coefficient value (5.540) which had no mediation effect and finally in relationship of Job satisfaction and turnover intention the significant value (17.83) which showed full mediation. The indirect effect of all variables was significant.

**Conclusion**

To assess and provide the valuable findings to the research of turnover intention, this study described why and how the turnover intention impact on the remuneration, supervisory support, work life policies and mediating role of job satisfaction in private schools in the context of

Pakistan. Money and compensation play crucial role in the job satisfaction of the employees and intention to quit the organization. Job satisfaction can be increased if the employees are given good pay package, benefits and flexible working hours. These factors are great motivators. Supervisory support has also proven to be greater influenced on the turnover intention of the employees. In education sector, work greatly depends on the relationship between employees and supervisors that affect the job satisfaction and relations motivate the employees to do well, consequently improve the level of their performance.

#### **Recommendation**

The results of the analysis recommend some suggestion for the education sector specially private schools that will help them to retain their teachers in the private school and improve the performance of teachers as well as private schools in Pakistan. Turnover Intention and job satisfaction are positively associated to each other and Turnover Intention have direct impact on job satisfaction. The private schools must offer some motivational plan for their teachers. These motivational plans could be like:

Improved remuneration as it is observed in private schools mostly teachers worry about their low remuneration, due to the low pay they always remains in search of other opportunities so it is essential to improve their remuneration for satisfactory work and retention of the teachers in private schools.

Supervisory support should be increased because if supervisors will be supportive then employees can do their job more confidently and satisfactorily. Supervisory should conduct the training and development programs for the staff to enhance their abilities.

Work life policies should be flexible, teachers should be provided with flexible working hours, relaxing work environment, reduction of overwork, in this way they can maintain balance between their job and private life happily.

Job satisfaction of employees at workplace should be properly obtainable. It is very important to keep the employees satisfy against their good performance and productivity of the institute. It is recommended that private institute must provide good working environment and remuneration for the retention of the employees.

Recognition is very essential for all types of jobs; teachers must be recognized for their achievements and excellent performance.

#### **Limitation of study**

The first limitation of this study arises from the research design, unit analysis research was preferred by the researcher because it is an effective method to test the study hypothesis and it is more time saving

method. Unit analysis research, collect the data at one point in time and a time order arrangement cannot be created to infer causation (Shadish, Cok and Campbell, 2002). Another limitation of this research is the data collection method because it uses a self-report survey as a primary source of data that creates the problem to the variance method.

**Future research**

There are number of chances for future research established on the results of this research. In future researchers can explain the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention. This study indicates that supervisory support is very important with teachers which will increase the teacher's job satisfaction in the private schools.

Another indication for future research is to generalize the results with this sample in a different sector and context. Although the relationship in our research were supported, it may be that the nature of the sample uses the prominence of the job satisfaction and turnover intention, which provision helping the need of the job satisfaction in the private schools. A good way to employ the resulted terms of the conclusions is to smear them in generalized way which depends on the sample of the female and male teachers in the private schools. This study indicates an open way and encourages the future researcher to work on how respondent answers affect the turnover intention in the private school.

## References

- Abdul Rahman, S. R. (2008). Measuring turnover intention: A study of IT professionals in Pakistan. *International review of business research papers*, 4 (3), 45-55.
- Adegoye, A. T. (2012). Employee perception of career progression and turnover intention among bank workers in Ife central local government area Osun state. *Research Journal in organizational Psychology & educational studies*, 6 (1), 353-360.
- Adenji, A. A. (2011). Organizational climate and job satisfaction among academic staff in some selected private universities. *International journal of management sciences*, 15 (2), 202.
- Afshin. (2012). Impact of training on employee performance: a study of telecommunication sector in Pakistan, interdisciplinary. *Journal of contemporary research in business*, 4 (6), 34-87.
- Hsu, H. Y. (2009). Organizational learning culture's influence on job satisfaction, organizational commitment and turnover intention among R & D professionals in Taiwan. *graduate business studies*, 4, 214.
- Hundera, M. B. (2014, September 9). Factors affecting academic staff turnover intention and mediating effect of gender. *International journal of research in business management*, 57-70.
- Huselid. (1995). Human resource practices, turnover productivity and firm performance. *Doctoral dissertation of Human resource*, 120-190.
- Morries, M. L. (2010). The impact of employee engagement factors and job satisfaction on turnover intent. *Journal of management sciences*, 8 (2), 113.
- Mosadeghard, A. M. (2013). Quality of working life: An antecedent to employee turnover intention. *International journal of health policy and management*, 1 (1), 43-50.
- Mukhtar, F. (2012). Work life balance and job satisfaction among faculty at Iowa State University. *business graduate*, 125.
- Mutuma, M. K. (2013). An evaluation of remuneration scheme in relation to staff turnover in private universities. *Journal of poverty, investment and development*, 2 (2), 24.
- Nienaber, H. (2012). Exploring factors influencing voluntary turnover intent of generation X public servant. *Acta commercii*, 84.
- Noor, S. (2008). Examining the relationship between work life conflict, stress and turnover intention among marketing executives in Pakistan. *Internal journal of business and management sciences*, 3 (11), 102.
- Nurita Juhdi, F. P. (2013). HR practices and turnover intention. *International journal of human resource management: The mediating role of organizational commitment and organizational engagement*, 24 (15), 3002-3019.
- Nwagbara, U. (2013). The impact of effective communication on employee turnover intention at bank. *Management sciences*, 2 (4), 13-21.
- Nyamubarwa, W. (2013). "I am considering leaving soon" -Turnover intentions of academic librarians. *Journal of business administration and education*, 4 (2), 76-90.
- Olusegun, S. O. (2013, September 4). Influence of job satisfaction on turnover intentions of library personnel in selected universities in South West Nigeria. *Library philosophy and practice*, 86.