

# **English Language Teachers' Opinion on Intermediate English Textbooks taught in Punjab Pakistan**

Bushra Shoukat\* & Mamuna Ghani\*\*

## **Abstract**

*Historically, the textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan have remained under the control of political, religious and social ideologies. The present study is conducted to get the opinion of English language teachers, teaching English at higher secondary level in the public schools of Punjab, Pakistan. The study examines the role of textbooks of English at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan. To what extent, textbooks of English language are effective to transform curriculum guidelines into syllabus. Textbooks play a pivotal role in achieving the objectives and goals of curriculum. The results showed that textbooks need to be revised. Efforts should be exerted to make textbooks effective and result oriented. The present paper suggested that the improved, revised and updated textbooks of English would help to improve the learning, teaching and overall education system.*

**Keywords:** Textbooks; English; Higher Secondary; Curriculum; Pakistani Education.

## **Introduction**

Education plays significant role for the prosperity of a nation in terms of political, economical and social development.<sup>1</sup> Furthermore, in education the importance of English language around the world is unquestionable. Pakistani education system pays special attention on English language from the very beginning in its educational setting. English language is introduced as compulsory subject from the class I to class XIV. Mehboob by labeling English language as the world language stated that if the medium of education is English then Pakistan would be an attractive place for global investment.<sup>2</sup>

---

\* Bushra Shoukat, PhD Scholar, Department of English, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur.

\*\* Dr. Mamuna Ghani, Professor, Department of English, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur.

Pakistani education system is divided into three sectors; public, private and Madrassa. Public sector is run by government, private sector by non government organizations, and Madrassa sector by Mullas.<sup>3</sup> Iqbal<sup>4</sup> found that education in Pakistan is divided into primary, secondary, higher secondary and degree classes. The present study has chosen to get the opinion of English language teachers about the textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in the public sector of Punjab, Pakistan. Higher secondary education plays a decisive role in the life of students, because at this stage the learners have to choose their careers and professions. Most of the studies for professional development are in English language. So, English language taught at higher secondary level should make learners to have command on it. In Pakistan, English language is in vogue for vocational and personal communication.<sup>5</sup>

Textbooks are meant to help nations to achieve their national goals, and strengthen their ideological foundations. Textbooks are the effective way of ruling the consciousness of people.<sup>6</sup> The function of textbooks is to manifest the ideologies and philosophies of curriculum. Textbooks influence the person's worldview, and the gravity of influence depends on the teacher that how teacher imparts the knowledge provided in the textbooks, and what method of teaching is acquired etc. In this regard, how a teacher perceives textbooks is a main factor on which the whole process of education depends.

#### *Review of Literature*

Saeed in a comparative study of education of Pakistan and UK stated that curriculum of all the subjects is uniform all over in Pakistan, but textbooks vary under the supervision of provincial textbook boards.<sup>7</sup> Khalid in an analytical study reached to the conclusion that the quality of textbooks is low with a lot of printing errors. Furthermore, the information in the textbooks was presented in a puzzling manner.<sup>8</sup> Khalid criticized the government policy of uniform curricula by 2015. The details of this uniform curriculum expose that by uniform curricula government simply means a uniform outline that is supposed to be taught. Schools will be free to recommend any textbook they prefer to, without any solid reason. This liberty would lead the whole education system to chaos.<sup>9</sup>

Rehman conducted a study to find the 'others' presented in the textbooks, along with the view of finding out the Islamic militant literature in Pakistan.<sup>10</sup> Rehman and Khan criticized the overall education system of Pakistan in general and textbooks in

particular. The content of textbooks has no immediate connection with real life situations that the learners are supposed to face. Additionally, the textbooks are outdated.<sup>11</sup>

### *Research Objectives*

The objectives of the study are to:

- To explore the merits and demerits of textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Pakistan.
- To compare the opinion of male and female teachers regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- To compare the opinion of rural and urban teachers regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- To compare the opinion of English language teachers regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan, on the basis of districts.

### *Methodology*

The present study is quantitative in nature. 1379 teachers, teaching English at higher secondary level in the public schools of Punjab, Pakistan participated in this research:

Table 1: Sample of Government Higher Secondary Schools English Teachers

	Total Number of Teachers (1379)				
	Rural (323)		Urban (1056)		Total
	Male	Female	Male	Female	
<i>Punjab</i>	172	151	574	482	1379

A structured questionnaire (Appendix A) was used to collect data. The questionnaire adapted for present study was developed by Akhtar.<sup>12</sup> The questionnaire for present study consisted of 12 items having five point Likert scale response. The scoring key of the questionnaire is Strongly Disagree = 1, Disagree = 2, Undecided = 3, Agree = 4, and Strongly Agree = 5.

### *Procedure of Analysis*

The data were collected from 1379 teachers of English language teaching at higher secondary level, from the 23 districts of Punjab, Pakistan (Appendix B). Twenty three district of the province

Punjab were categorized into three regions of upper, central and southern Punjab (Appendix C). Each questionnaire was given a unique identification number. Likert scale data were put in a variable file of SPSS version 21. Descriptive and inferential statistics were applied for the analysis of data. Frequency (f), percentage (%), mean (M) and standard deviation (SD) were obtained in descriptive statistics. In inferential statistics t-test and ANOVA were applied to find the differences of opinion of English language teachers on the basis of gender, residential area and region.

### Data Analysis and Interpretation

Table 2: Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents

Items	SDA f(%)	DA f(%)	U f(%)	A f(%)	SA f(%)	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>
The title page of the prescribed English book is attractive.	93 (7)	481 (35)	89 (6)	464 (34)	251 (18)	3.21	1.28
The quality of paper of the textbook is good.	87 (7)	503 (36)	89 (6)	559 (41)	141 (10)	3.12	1.19
The script of textbook is free of errors.	112 (8)	477 (35)	183 (13)	459 (33)	148 (11)	3.04	1.19
The subject matter of textbook creates interest for learning.	207 (15)	490 (36)	105 (8)	434 (31)	142 (10)	2.87	1.29
The content is selected in the light of the objectives.	135 (10)	472 (34)	150 (11)	453 (33)	169 (12)	3.03	1.24
The organization of contents for higher secondary school English is from simple to complex.	113 (8)	341 (25)	146 (11)	584 (42)	193 (14)	3.29	1.21
Content being taught at higher secondary level is helpful in achieving the curriculum objectives.	143 (10)	449 (33)	163 (12)	488 (35)	135 (10)	3.02	1.22
The introduction of each chapter highlights the aims of learning that chapter.	193 (14)	433 (31)	137 (10)	444 (32)	172 (13)	2.98	1.30
Exercises at the end of the chapter cover the	233 (17)	396 (29)	133 (10)	457 (33)	159 (11)	2.94	1.32

topics of the entire chapter.							
Number of solved examples is sufficient in the textbook.	226 (16)	502 (36)	126 (9)	380 (28)	145 (11)	2.79	1.29
Difficult concepts are clearly explained in the textbook where necessary.	186 (14)	537 (39)	132 (10)	371 (26)	154 (11)	2.83	1.27
A list of the key terms is provided at the end of the book.	169 (12)	339 (25)	126 (9)	572 (41)	173 (13)	3.18	1.27

Table 2 indicates English language teachers' opinion about textbook, subject matter and contents. Forty two percent teachers opined that the title page of the prescribed English book is not attractive. Whereas 42% of the teachers expressed the opposite view, and the remaining 6% of the total respondents were undecided. So, it remains undecided that the title page of the prescribed English book is attractive or not.

Fifty one percent teachers opined that the quality of paper of the textbook is good. In contrast to their opinion, 43% of the teachers expressed that the quality of paper of the textbook is not good, along this 6% of the respondents remained undecided about the inquiry. So, it can be concluded that teachers do not believe that the quality of paper of the textbook is good.

Forty four percent of the teachers opined that the script of textbook is free of errors. Thirteen percent of the teachers remained undecided about the question, whereas, 43% of the teachers expressed the opposite opinion. So, it can be concluded that the script of textbook is free of errors.

Fifty one percent teachers opined that the subject matter of textbook does not create interest for learning. In contrast to their opinion, 41% of the teachers expressed that the subject matter of textbook creates interest for learning, along this 8% of the respondents remained undecided about the investigation. So, it can be concluded that the subject matter of textbook does not create interest for learning.

Forty four percent of the teachers opined that the content is not selected in the light of the objectives. Eleven percent of the teachers remained undecided about the issue. Whereas, 45% of the teachers expressed that the content is selected in the light of the

objectives. So, it can be concluded that the content is selected in the light of the objectives.

Fifty six percent of teachers opined that the organization of contents for higher secondary school English is from simple to complex. Whereas 33% of the teachers expressed the opposite view, and the remaining 11% of the total respondents were undecided. So, it can be concluded that the organization of contents for higher secondary school English is from simple to complex.

Forty three percent of the teachers opined that content being taught at higher secondary level is not helpful in achieving the curriculum objectives. Twelve percent of the teachers remained undecided about the question, whereas, 45% of the teachers expressed the positive opinion. On the basis of comparison between the agreed and disagreed respondents it can be concluded that content being taught at higher secondary level is helpful in achieving the curriculum objectives.

Forty five percent teachers opined that the introduction of each chapter highlights the aims of learning that chapter. In contrast to their opinion, 45% of the teachers expressed that the introduction of each chapter does not highlight the aims of learning that chapter, along this 10% of the respondents remained undecided about the inquiry. The percentage of agreed and disagreed respondents is equal. So, it cannot be concluded that the introduction of each chapter highlights the aims of learning that chapter or not.

Forty four percent teachers opined that exercises at the end of the chapter cover the topics of the entire chapter. In contrast to their opinion, 46% of the teachers expressed that exercises at the end of the chapter does not cover the topics of the entire chapter, along this 10% of the respondents remained undecided about the inquisition. So, it can be concluded that the exercises at the end of the chapter does not cover the topics of the entire chapter.

Fifty two percent of the teachers opined that number of solved examples is sufficient in the textbook. Nine percent of the teachers remained undecided about the issue. Whereas, 39% of the teachers agreed that number of solved examples is sufficient in the textbook. On the basis of comparison between the agreed and disagreed respondents it can be concluded that number of solved examples is insufficient in the textbook.

Fifty three percent of teachers declared that difficult concepts are not clearly explained in the textbook where necessary. Whereas 37% of the teachers expressed the opposite view, and the

remaining 10% of the total respondents were undecided. So, it can be concluded that difficult concepts are not clearly explained in the textbook where necessary.

Thirty seven percent of the teachers opined that a list of the key terms is not provided at the end of the book. Nine percent of the teachers remained undecided about the question, whereas, 54% of the teachers expressed the positive opinion. On the basis of comparison between the agreed and disagreed respondents it can be concluded that a list of the key terms is provided at the end of the book.

Table 3: Difference between Male and Female Teachers' Opinion

	Male		Female		t-value	p-value
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	3.08	0.76	2.95	0.77	2.996	0.003

Table 3 shows the difference between the male and female teachers' opinion about their involvement in curriculum development process. Independent samples t-test was conducted to find the difference between the male and female teachers' opinion. The calculated  $t$ -value = 2.99 and  $p$ -value = 0.003 is smaller than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the opinion of male and female teachers is significant, female teachers are more dissatisfied than male teachers.

Table 4: Difference between Teachers' Opinions on the Basis of Residential Area

	Rural		Urban		t-value	p-value
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	2.92	0.75	3.05	0.77	-2.60	.009

Table 4 shows the difference between teachers' opinion on the basis of their residential area. Independent samples t-test was applied. The calculated  $t$ -value = -2.60 and  $p$ -value = 0.009 is smaller than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the teachers of rural and urban areas is significant, rural teachers are more dissatisfied than urban teachers.

Table 5: Difference between Rural Male and Urban Male Teachers' Opinion

Sections	Male		Urban		t-value	p-value
	Rural					
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	2.98	0.70	3.12	0.78	-2.03	0.042

Table 5 shows the difference between rural male and urban male teachers' opinion. Independent samples t-test was applied. The calculated  $t$ -value = -2.03 and  $p$ -value = 0.042 is smaller than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the opinion of rural male and urban male teachers is significant, rural male teachers are more dissatisfied than urban male teachers.

Table 6: Difference between Rural Female and Urban Female Teachers' Opinion

Sections	Female		Urban		t-value	p-value
	Rural					
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	2.87	0.82	2.99	0.76	-1.64	0.102

Table 6 shows the difference between the rural female and urban female teachers' opinion. Independent samples t-test was applied. The calculated  $t$ -value = -1.64 and  $p$ -value = 0.10 in the factor contents, subject matter and textbook is greater than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the opinion of rural female and urban female teachers is insignificant with reference to contents, subject matter and textbooks.

Table 7: Difference between Rural Male and Rural Female Teachers' Opinion

Section	Rural		Female		t-value	p-value
	Male					
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	2.98	0.70	2.87	0.82	1.33	0.184



Table 7 shows the difference between the rural male and rural female teachers' opinion. Independent samples t-test was applied. The calculated  $t$ -value = 1.33 and  $p$ -value = 0.18 is greater than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the opinion of rural male and rural female teachers is insignificant with reference to contents, subject matter and textbooks.

Table 8: Difference between Urban Male and Urban Female Teachers' Opinion

Section	Urban				t-value	p-value
	Male		Female			
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	3.12	0.78	2.99	0.76	2.69	0.007

Table 8 shows the difference between the urban male and urban female teachers' opinion. Independent samples t-test was applied. The calculated  $t$ -value = 2.69 and  $p$ -value = 0.007 is smaller than alpha ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). So, the difference between the opinion of urban male and urban female teachers is significant, urban female teachers are more dissatisfied than urban male teachers.

Table 9: Difference between Teachers' Opinion on the Basis of Districts

	Upper		Central		Southern		F	P
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
	Textbook, Subject Matter and Contents	3.13	0.75	3.09	0.72	2.91		

\* $p < .05$ , \*\*\* $p < 0.001$

Table 9 shows the difference between teachers' opinion belonging to different regions. ANOVA technique was applied. The calculated  $F$ -value ( $F = 12.0$ ,  $p$ -value = 0.00 and  $\alpha = 0.05$ ) indicates the significant difference ( $p < \alpha$ ) of opinion between the teachers of various regions of Punjab. Tukey test (post hoc test, table 10) was applied in order to study pair wise comparison for the regions of Punjab. On the basis of tukey test, the difference of opinion between the teachers of southern and upper, and the teachers of southern and central Punjab is significant with reference to contents, subject matter and textbooks. Hence, it can be concluded that the teachers of southern Punjab show more

discontent when compared to the teachers of upper and central Punjab regarding the factor of contents, subject matter and textbooks.

Table 10: Tukey HSD to Differentiate between Teachers' Opinion on the Basis of Districts

Multiple Comparisons						
Tukey HSD						
Dependent Variable	(I) Region	(J) Region	diff (I-J)	SE	P	
Contents, Subject Matter and Textbook	UPPER	Central	.03897	.05628	.768	
		Southern	.22042*	.04968	.000	
	Central	Southern	.18145*	.05058	.001	

\* The mean difference is significant at the 0.05 level

### Findings and Discussions

Regarding the merits and demerits of textbooks of English language taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan, the present study found:

- Teachers opined that the quality of paper, subject matter, exercises at the end of chapters, number of solved examples, and explanation of difficult concepts of textbooks of English language taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan are not up to the standard.
- Teachers opined positively that script is error free, content selection, content organization. Further teachers opined that content is helpful to achieve curriculum objectives, and key terms are provided in textbooks of English language taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.

On the whole English language teachers of higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan are not satisfied with textbooks of English language taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan. The finding is consistent with many studies regarding textbooks.<sup>13</sup>

The present research found that female teachers are more dissatisfied than male teachers regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan. The present research also found that rural teachers are more dissatisfied than urban teachers regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan. Furthermore, the present research also found that teachers of southern Punjab are more

dissatisfied if compared to the teachers of upper and central Punjab regarding textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.

### **Recommendations**

The present study has following recommendations:

- The quality of paper of textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan should be improved.
- The subject matter should be made interesting for learning of textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- Exercises at the end of chapters should be increased in the textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- Number of solved examples should be increased in the textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.
- Difficult concepts should be explained clearly in the textbooks of English taught at higher secondary level in Punjab, Pakistan.

## Notes & References

- <sup>1</sup> Hina Rehman and Nushad Khan, "Flaws in Pakistan's Educational System", *Abasyn University Journal of Social Sciences* 4, no. 1 (2011).
- <sup>2</sup> Mehboob, *Understanding Pakistan: The Future of English in Pakistan*. SPO Paper Discussion Series (2003).
- <sup>3</sup> Christopher M. Blanchard, *Islamic religious schools, madrasas: Background*, Library of Congress Washington DC Congressional Research Service (2007), See also Hussain Haqqani, "The Role of Islam in Pakistan's Future", *The Washington Quarterly* 28, no. 1, (2004): 85-96; Tariq Rahman, "Government Policies and the Politics of the Teaching of Urdu in Pakistan", *Annual of Urdu studies* 17 (2002): 95-124.
- <sup>4</sup> Muhammad Iqbal, *Education in Pakistan: Developmental Milestones* (Karachi:Paramount Publishing Enterprise, 2011).
- <sup>5</sup> Muhammad Shahid Farooq, Muhammad Uzair-Ul-Hassan, and S. Wahid, "Opinion of Second Language Learners about Writing Difficulties in English Language." *South Asian Studies* 27, no. 1 (2012): 183-194.
- <sup>6</sup> Tariq Rehman, "Images of the 'Other' in school Textbooks and Islamic Reading Material in Pakistan". In Lin Yates and Madeleine Grumet ed. *World yearbook of Education 2011*, Edition: 1st, Chapter: 12, (Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group, 2011): pp.181-198.
- <sup>7</sup> Muhammad Saeed, "Education System of Pakistan and the UK: Comparisons in Context of Inter-provincial and Inter-countries Reflections", *Bulletin of Education & Research* 29, no. 2, (2007): 43-57.
- <sup>8</sup> Saleem Mansur Khalid, "The New Blueprint for Pakistan's Education Policy: An Analytical Review", *Policy Perspectives* 4, no. 2 (2008).
- <sup>9</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>10</sup> Tariq Rehman, "Images of the 'Other' in school Textbooks and Islamic Reading Material in Pakistan", op.cit.
- <sup>11</sup> Hina Rehman and Nushad Khan, "Flaws in Pakistan's Educational System", op.cit.
- <sup>12</sup> Munazza Akhtar, *Analysis of Curriculum Development of a Model for Secondary Level in Pakistan*. Unpublished Thesis. (Rawalpindi: University Institute of Education and Research, University of Arid Agriculture Rawalpindi, 2004)
- <sup>13</sup> Maria Clemente, Elena Ramírez, and Ana B. Domínguez, "The selection of contents in school projects in Spain", *Curriculum inquiry* 30, no. 3 (2000): 295-317. See Also Cheryl J. Craig, "The Relationships Between and Among Teachers' Narrative Knowledge, Communities of Knowing, and School Reform: A Case of 'The Monkey's Paw' 1." *Curriculum inquiry* 31, no. 3 (2001): 303-331; David Kirk, and Doune MacDonald, "Teacher voice and ownership of curriculum change", *Journal of curriculum studies* 33, no. 5 (2001): 551-567; John Chi-Kin Lee, "Teacher receptivity to curriculum change in the implementation

---

stage: The case of environmental education in Hong Kong", *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 32, no. 1 (2000): 95-115; Okhee Lee, "Subject matter knowledge, classroom management, and instructional practices in middle school science classrooms", *Journal of research in science teaching* 32, no. 4 (1995): 423-440; Janine T. Remillard, "Curriculum materials in mathematics education reform: A framework for examining teachers' curriculum development", *Curriculum Inquiry* 29, no. 3 (1999): 315-342; James P. Spillane, "External reform initiatives and teachers' efforts to reconstruct their practice: The mediating role of teachers' zones of enactment", *Journal of curriculum Studies* 31, no. 2 (1999): 143-175; Devon Woods, "Teachers' Interpretations of Second Language Teaching Curricula", *RELC Journal: A Journal of Language Teaching and Research in Southeast Asia* 22, no. 2 (1991): 1-18.