

ETHICS IN ORGANISATIONS AND LEADERSHIP RESPONSE

Javed Iqbal Shah *

INTRODUCTION:

The increased awareness about ethics which gripped the whole Western world in 1980s due to a number of large-scale white-collar crimes has now roused the academicians, theorists, businessmen, politicians as well as the common man in Pakistan. Since reverting back to half-cooked democracy in 1985, we, in Pakistan, have read and heard the endless stories of corruption, flouting of rules, nepotism, and deceit and secret deals. The main characters in these stories are, of course, the proverbial unscrupulous politicians, followed closely by business magnets and bureaucrats. The great hullabaloo about the unsavoury acts of these ‘men of authority’ forces us to consider each and every case as an individual and unique one. In the quagmire of vast level and enormous magnitude of corruption, we perhaps forget that it is the culture of a society and especially the corporate culture which, working together, provide a fertile land for mushroom growth of such incidents. The purpose of this paper is neither to unearth “another corruption case” nor to blame anyone for the present state of our economy in general and of our organizations and institutions in particular. The main aim of this write-up is to relate ethics, ethical theories and ethical issues to corporate culture which prevails in our organizations. It will also be my endeavour to recommend some measures to raise ethical standards in Pakistani organizations.

* Squadron Leader Javed Iqbal Shah (Pakistan Air Force).

Why Ethics?

The issue of ethics in management of organizations is about two decades old when many scandals of misappropriation of funds and misuse of authority surfaced, especially in the United States of America. In Pakistan, awareness to this issue is a more recent phenomenon. Even today, many people ask: "Is ethics relevant to corporate operations? Isn't it too intangible, too theoretical, rather too philosophical and perhaps impracticable in the present scenario of New World Order? Could we clearly distinguish between what is ethical and what is not? What good, therefore, is it to discuss ethics in corporate settings when it has nothing to do with productivity, profitability, quotas and markets?" We frequently hear people saying that ethics is a relevant topic for those, who are not worried about competition and profits. A simple answer to most of this criticism is that ethics is as closely related to business and corporate organizations as profits, productivity, or market shares are. In organizations, a common code of ethics is necessary:-

- (a) To prevent rule of thumb, corruption and bribery.
- (b) To make competition within as well as without the organization fair and transparent.
- (c) To bring harmony in human relationships.
- (d) To make better use of resources.
- (e) To make provisions for more equitable distribution of resources and power.
- (f) To promote better and long lasting business.
- (g) To humanize the corporate culture.

Is Ethics in Corporate Organizations Expensive?

Since most of the organizations' prime objective is stated to be profit-making; a question usually asked is: "Is ethics in corporate organizations too expensive to follow?" The answer is: "Absolutely, No." Rather, it is more desirable from organization's point of view to promote ethical practices because these would certainly pay large dividends at least in the long run. Today, very few businessmen in the Western world would be as blunt as President of a leading US automobile when he said that he was not in the business of making cars, but in the business of making money. A number of renowned business concerns like IBM, Hewlett-Packard, J. C. Penney Company, Johnson & Johnson, Aetna Life and Casualty, Prudential Insurance Company, Xerox Corporation and many others have noticed that their profitability and market shares keep on increasing due to their consistent resolve to encourage and follow ethical practices in their organizations. It would not be out of place here to mention that the natives of the sub-continent of India were first introduced to 'Islam' by Muslim traders who impressed Indians by their virtues of equity, truthfulness, fair dealings, and fear of Allah even in worldly affairs. In short, it would not be over-enthusiasm to proclaim that it is good business, in this world as well as hereafter, to be ethical in business dealings.

Definition:

Before addressing the core issues of ethics, let's define 'ethics'. Webster defines it as "the discipline dealing with that which is good and bad and with moral duty and obligation."¹ Very often, ethics is concerned with good than with bad. More broadly, ethics may be defined as "that branch of philosophy dealing with values relating to human conduct, with respect to rightness or wrongness of certain actions

and to the goodness or badness of the motives and ends of such actions.’’²
In organizations, people are usually interested to find out what to expect from the company, other individuals and themselves too. In order to remove ambiguities and uncertainties, company policies, rules and regulations are formulated so that everyone gets a fair, impartial and standardized treatment at the work place.

Theories of Ethics:

There are a number of theories of ethics based either on experience, rationality, utility, human rights, and equity or on religion. For the purpose of this paper, I shall discuss only two theories, namely Utilitarian and Intuitive. Thereafter, I shall present a theoretical framework of a new theory on ethics, which is based on Islamic principles.

Utilitarian Theory:

This theory was presented by the famous eighteen-century Englishman, Jeremy Bentham.³ According to his theory, plans and actions should be assessed on the basis of their consequences. The bottom line here is that plans and actions should produce the greatest good for the greatest number of people. In the light of this simple and straight-forward theory, the ethical value of any action or plan could be judged. For example, a company rule or policy formulated to favour a few selected individuals could be adjudged unethical on the basis of parameters of utilitarian theory. However, the same rule or policy would be taken as ethical if it benefits the greatest number of people. A real-life example would certainly clarify the working of this theory. For instance, a company rule to provide company cars to a few big bosses while refusing to provide transport facilities to the rest of the employees

on the pretext of 'financial constraints' would be unethical because it does not produce "the greatest good for the greatest number of people." Here, one must make a distinction between 'legality of an action' and 'the ethical base of an action.' From the above-quoted example, the company' policy of providing free transport facility to a few is certainly legal in all aspects but unethical at the same time since it does not ensure the greatest good for the greatest number of employees. In this way, this theory presents a remarkably simple framework to judge the ethical standing of any corporate, political, social or individual action.

Intuitive Theory:

According to this theory, ethics are not necessarily derived from experience or logic. Rather, people usually learn automatically what is right and what is wrong. The bottom line is that our conscience must be alive to guide us in ethical matters. Intuitive theory suggests that all people would think alike ethically and act accordingly, were it not for:-⁴

- (a) Bad environments.
- (b) Poor political institutions.
- (c) Faulty education.
- (d) Mistaken religious training.

The theory guides effectively in most of the ethical cases, however, it may not work very well in grey areas where the distinction between 'good' and 'bad' is not clear. Secondly, the theory also appears to be inadequate where common standards of ethical behaviour are needed since individual standards of different people might be different. Third limitation of this theory is that some people might train their conscience in such a way that it might say only those things one wants to

hear. In fact, a reliable system of ethical philosophy should be based on rational, intuitive and revelation approaches.

Ethics – An Islamic Perspective:

While most of the ‘man-made’ theories on ethics accept the ethical or unethical base of an action on some implicit or explicit concept, definition, or formula, the Islamic perspective on ethics reserves the right of declaring an action or plan as right or wrong for the Almighty Allah, the Creator of this universe. Accordingly, ethics in Muslim societies ought to be part of the greater scheme of societal organisation in the following manner: -

- (a) Belief System (“Imaniyat”)
- (b) Prayers (“Ibadaat”)
- (c) Ethics (“Akhlaqiyat”)
- (d) Personal Conduct (“Moamlaat”)

Belief system of a Muslim society is essentially based on five fundamentals, namely, belief in God, the messenger, Muhammad (SAW), the Last Day, the Scriptures, Al-Qur’an, and belief in angels. Prayers call for all Muslims to fulfil their obligations regarding “Haqooq Allah”, namely offering five times prayers, fasting during the month of Ramzan, paying zaka’at (the share of the poor in the incomes of the rich), pilgrimage to Mecca at least once in a lifetime, and struggling in the cause of Allah (i.e., “Jihad”)

In addition to its foundation on beliefs and prayers, ethics according to the teachings of Islam is based on the principles of truthfulness, justice and equity, contentment and humility,

accountability, and transparency. And lastly, personal conduct of Muslims ought to flow from adherence of followers to earlier three systems, namely, beliefs, prayers and ethics.

As emphasised earlier, Islamic perspective on ethics is part of the greater scheme of societal organisation. Thus, an attempt would be made in the following sub-paragraphs to highlight the integrated place of ethical system along with other systems, namely “Imaniyat”; “Ibadaat” and ultimately “Moamlaat”.

Elements of “Imaniyat”:

Following are the fundamental elements of Islamic Belief System (“imaniyat”): -

(a) **Belief in Oneness of God and in the Last Prophet.**

First and the foremost element of “Imaniyat” is belief in oneness of God and belief in Muhammad (Sall’Allah-ho-Alehey-Wassalam) as the last prophet. As warned at several places in the Holy Qur’an, the biggest sin and un-pardonable one, if the sinner does not repent before his / her death, is to ascribe partners to Allah. This single belief in oneness of the Creator motivates the believers to refrain from unethical practices because He has spelled out the definitions of unethical actions and their punishments in no ambiguous terms. Belief in one and the only one God, and His power to write or mould one’s destiny, works wonders to raise ethical standards in several ways, for e.g.,

- (i) It dissuades the believers to indulge in unethical practices due to fear of accountability by the All Powerful God at any time.

(ii) It motivates people to speak and stand up against unethical deeds since they know that nothing wrong could happen to them or to their family without the will of God. And, whatever is the will of God that is always in the best interest of true believers.

(iii) It reminds intermittently that reward from Allah Almighty for good deeds is always far better than the worldly benefits gained through unethical means.

(iv) It consoles the believers in hours of distress that reward hereafter will be much better as well as everlasting than the comforts in this world.

(b) **Belief in the Day of Judgment.** The second most important feature of “Imaniyat” is the belief of the followers in the Day of Judgment. People are constantly reminded that their stay in this world is extremely short and that they'll have to gather before the Lord on the Last Day when they'll be made to answer for each and every action in this world. Therefore, one must be prepared to face all these questions, at least on the Day of Judgment even if one escapes accountability in this world. The following verse clearly highlights the relative short life of this world as compared to the life after death:-

"The day [will come] when He will gather them again, as though they had stayed [in this world] but an hour of the day. They will recognize one another. Lost are those who disbelieve in meeting their Lord and do not follow the right path."

[46 – 10, Yunas]

(c) **Belief in the Scriptures and Angles.** Belief in Holy Qur'an is no less important since it contains all the fundamental

beliefs, tenets as well as principles enshrined in Islamic Shari'ah. As we cannot see Allah in person, so is the case with the presence of angels, but belief in angels gets credence from belief in Holy Qur'an.

Elements of "Ibadaat":

According to fundamental tenets of Islam, following are the inalienable parts of the Islamic Prayer System ("Ibadaat"): -

(a) **Five-times Prayer.** Five-times prayer is the most important pillar of Islam after "Imaniyat". Ritual of saying five-times prayer motivates the believer to feel the presence of Allah and a belief that he would have to stand before Him on the Last Day in order to justify his conduct. Thus, five-times prayers have a direct relation with the ethical conduct of a man in the day-to-day affairs.

(b) **Fasting during the Month of Ramzan.** In addition to five-times prayers, it is also obligatory for every believer to observe fasting during the month of Ramzan. Since nobody can effectively supervise whether an individual is fasting or not, this ritual further solidifies the belief that at least Allah is cognisant of everything. In this way, a true believer is expected to refrain from indulging in unethical practices.

(c) **Pilgrimage to Mecca.** It is obligatory on every able bodied, resourceful Muslim to perform "Hajj" at least once in a lifetime.

Elements of "Akhlaqiyat":

Allah (SWT) attaches great importance to good conduct and bearing. Thus, He addresses the messenger and says, "No doubt, you are on the highest pedestal of "akhlaq". Following are the salient elements of Islamic Ethical System ("Akhlaqiyat"): -

(a) **Truthfulness.** Value of truthfulness is acknowledged in all religions, societies and cultures. The virtues of truth make a society civilized and liveable, while lie destroys the very fabric it

is made of. Truthfulness includes practicing truth in beliefs, intention, words, determination, and action. On virtues of truth, Holy Qur'an says:-

“That Allah may reward the true men for their truth, and punish the hypocrites if He will, or relent toward them [if He will]. Look! Allah is forgiving, merciful.”

[24 – 33, Al-Ahzab]

“Do not confuse truth with falsehood, nor conceal the truth knowingly.”

[42 – 2, Al-Baqarah]

The root-cause of many unethical practices is not speaking the truth, the whole truth. Therefore, Allah guards us against telling a lie in the following way:-

“We invoke the curse of Allah upon those who lie”

[61 – 3, Al-Imran]

There are a number of sayings of the Holy Prophet [peace be upon him] on virtues of truth, for instance,

“A person came to the Holy Prophet [peace be upon him] and asked him, what is the holiest endeavour? He answered: Proclaiming the truth before a tyrannical ruler.”

[Muslim]

“A false oath may promote a sale, but empties the profit of all blessing.”

[Masnad Ahmad]

(b) **Justice and Equity.** Allah guards the believers against displaying unjust or inequitable behaviour. On justice and equity, Holy Qur'an says:-

"O' you who believe! Be you staunch in justice, witnesses for Allah, even though it be against yourselves or [your] parents or [your] kindred, whether [the case be of] a rich man or a poor man, for Allah is nearer unto both [than you are]. So follow not passion lest you lapse [from truth] and if you lapse or fall away then look! Allah is ever Informed of what you do."

[135 – 4, An-Nisa]

Discrimination of all kinds persists in all societies. We see discrimination on the basis of nationality, class, caste, clan, faith, colour of skin, geographical origin, amity or enmity, alma mater, etc. The evils of unfair discrimination are also as numerous as its kinds. Recounting the evils of discrimination is not within the scope of this paper, but the following points would certainly facilitate comprehending the gravity of this widespread unethical practice:-

- (i) It divides a society or community into different 'warring' factions, each striving hard to meet its narrowly-defined ends. Hence, it creates dissension and dissatisfaction in communities.
- (ii) Unfair discrimination creates unfair grounds for different sections of people and hence makes it difficult for some to survive and grow in the society or organization which provides undue advantages to others.
- (iii) It results in illegitimate transfer of resources from one section of population to another.
- (iv) It makes lives of most of the people miserable.
- (v) It adversely affects the motivation, morale and productivity of most of the employees, thus making the organization less competitive and less profitable.

(vi) It discourages people to make long term commitments with their organizations. In discriminatory environment, bright and energetic employees usually leave the organization to join a better one. This again results in lessened competitiveness since the organization is gradually left with a bulk of mediocre personnel.

Holy Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) used to guard his followers against unfair discrimination. On one occasion, he said:-

You will witness unfair discrimination after I am gone, then be patient till you meet me at the Kausar in the other world."

[Tirmzi]

(c) **Accountability.** Islamic concept of accountability for unlawful or unethical deeds does not merely rely on the concept of life after death; it also provides institutional arrangements in the form of Courts, "Ombudsman", and "Mohtsib" to bring the offenders to book. According to the Islamic concept of justice and fair play, no person is considered above law. More a person possesses authority, the more accountable he or she becomes. On an occasion, Holy Prophet [peace be upon him] said:-

"Each one of you is responsible for your deeds so you will be asked about your responsibilities. A ruler is responsible in respect of his subordinates too, so he will be accountable in respect of them also..."

[Bokhari, Muslim, Abu Daud, Tirmzi]

Early Islamic era of first four caliphs is replete with examples of general as well as institutional accountability of rulers. For instance, when Hazrat Abu Bakr was elected as first

caliph, he declared: "I am chosen as your *Amir* though I am not the best among you. If I do good, help me but if I fall away, correct me..."⁵ During the period of second caliph, financial position of every official was recorded before appointment to the office and whenever an abnormal increase in the financial status of an official was detected, a thorough investigation was carried out and the un-accounted amount was transferred to the treasury with severe penalties for the official as well.

(d) **Contentment and Humility.** Since many worldly vices occur due to man's lust for power, authority and status; Islam discourages pride and boasting for self-projection. In this context, Holy Qur'an says:-

"Look! Allah loves not such as are proud and boastful."

[36 – 4, An-Nisa]

In Islam, authority of an office is a trust, which is bestowed on an individual, therefore, one must not feel happy when appointed as a ruler over others, for one would become more accountable in this world as well as on the Last Day. Holy Prophet Muhammad [peace be upon him] advised his followers not to seek power and office for themselves in the following way:-

"Do not ask to be appointed to an office, for you'll be given to the office if you seek it yourself. But, if you are called to it without your asking, you will receive divine help in discharging its responsibilities."

[Muslim]

(e) **Transparency in Public Affairs.** During early days of Islam, an atmosphere of openness prevailed in the society. Most of the people usually spoke up on different forums and demanded clarifications from the rulers. People were free to criticize the behaviour, attitudes and actions of officials if considered contrary to the fundamental teachings of Islam. For instance, on one occasion, a person repeatedly said to Hazrat Umer: "O' Omer! Be you afraid of Allah." Some people tried to stop the man, but the caliph forbade them to do so by saying: "No, let him speak up. If these people will not speak, they are useless and if we do not admit our faults, we are."⁶ Another incidence also signifies the emphasis placed by the Muslim rulers on transparency in public affairs. Once Hazrat Omer fell sick and he was advised to use honey, which was available in "Bait-ul-Ma'al". But, the caliph did not consider it proper to use it without seeking permission. Therefore, he went to "Masjid-i-Nabvi" and asked people if he could take some honey from "Bait-ul-Ma'al" for personal use.⁷

Elements of "Moamlaat":

"Moamlaat" means personal conduct or dealings of a Muslim in day-to-day affairs. Personal conduct of a Muslim ought to be firmly based on first three systems, namely, belief system, prayers and ethics. There are several moral injunctions, which Islam has enjoined on its followers for almost every aspect of practical life. After purging oneself of the boundless lust of this world and emancipating one's spirit from the servitude of "self" (ego), the very first sphere of a Muslim's life is his own home. Stressing on the duties of believers toward their wives, the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) said,

“Among you the best are those who are good to their wives.” [Tirmizi]

After home, the next sphere of duties of a believer concerns his parents, siblings and other near relatives. Islam attaches so much importance to personal conduct of a believer with his parents that Allah has mentioned it immediately after the obligations of a believer toward Him in the following verse: -

“And serve Allah. Ascribe nothing as partner unto Him. (Show) kindness unto parents.” [36 – 4, An-Nisa]

“And lower unto them the wings of submission through mercy and say: My Lord! Have mercy on them as they did care for me when I was little.” [17 – 24,]

In order of precedence, the place of neighbours is second to one's family. Prophet Muhammad (SAW) once said, ***“The Angel Gabriel so repeatedly advised me about the rights of the neighbours that I began to think that my neighbour is meant to be my heir.”*** [Bukhari] After neighbours, Islam attaches great importance to rights of all other human beings, be they fellow-travellers or slave and be they Muslim or non-believers. Allah (SWT) says in Holy Qur'an: -

“(Show) kindness unto parents and unto near kindred, and orphans and the needy and unto the neighbourer who is of him (unto you) and unto neighbourer who is not of him, and the fellow-traveller and the way-farer and the slaves.” [36 – 4, An-Nisa]

Relationship of the believer with his rulers and his subjects is no less important. From standpoint of social and administrative

requirements, each individual in an Islamic society is either in a position to command or to obey. Following saying of Holy Prophet, Muhammad (SAW) guides in this sphere of human behaviour: -

“He who is entrusted with the responsibility to lead the Muslims but does not suffer hardship for them, nor thinks of their betterment will not enter the Paradise”

[Muslim]

Allah (SWT) also provides guidance concerning behaviour of believers with non-believers in the following verse of Holy Qur'an: -

"O you who believe! Be steadfast witnesses for Allah in equity and let not hatred of any people seduce you that you deal not justly. Deal justly that is nearer to your duty. Observe your duty to Allah. Look! Allah is Informed of what you do."

[8 – 5, Al-Mai'da]

While it is good to use any ethical theory to decide about moral standing of any action, it is always better to follow the most comprehensive system so that the highest standards of ethical behaviour could be achieved in the society and in organizations as well. For instance, we could take guidance from utilitarian theory while formulating various organizational policies, rules and regulations. However, in some cases, an action considered ethical on the basis of the utilitarian theory could prove to be unethical according to the Islamic theory. An example here would certainly clarify the situation. Let's assume that while determining the ethical basis of some action or plan, we consider the utilitarian theory as a frame of reference. An organizational decision to grant ten percent dearness allowance to all personnel will certainly be appreciated by all and will also be considered

as an ethical plan, keeping in view the parameters of the theory [to provide the greatest good to the greatest number of people]. However, if 99% of the personnel force the management to withdraw the dearness allowance from one percent personnel belonging to a minority; the decision will remain ethical from utilitarian viewpoint. However, such a decision will be considered as unethical keeping in view the principle of justice and equity of the Islamic perspectives on ethics. Thus, such a discriminatory law or rule will be declared un-Islamic, hence null-n-void.

Institutionalising Ethics at Work Places:

Managers and leaders, especially at the top level of the organizations frequently face situations that require ethical judgments. Often, there are not easy and straight-forward solutions to many ethical questions. Therefore, a conceptual framework, either in the form of some ethical theory is essential to help managers and employees analyse and evaluate their decisions. Top level managers and leaders have more responsibility to create an organization environment that fosters and encourages ethical decision making. One way of doing so is by institutionalising ethics at work centres. This means applying and integrating various ethical concepts into daily action. Institutionalisation of ethics may be accomplished by carrying out the following steps:-

- (a) By defining explicitly some common ethical standards against which actions or behaviours of people would be compared.
- (b) By appointing a permanent ethical board or committee so that:-
 - (i) It could work continuously on updating the code.

- (ii) It records and maintains data about ethical issues.
 - (iii) It carries out empirical research on ethic-related issues and concepts.
 - (iv) It recommends changes or modifications in existing laws, rules, regulations and policies to bring these in line with the commonly held ethical standards.
 - (v) It publishes the findings and actions taken in various cases related to unethical practices in the organization.
- (c) By establishing the office of the Chief Mohtsib to hear and decide about various complaints concerning unethical practices at work places.
- (d) By providing different forums for open discussion on ethical issues, for instance, ethics meetings, seminars on ethics, etc.
- (e) By teaching ethics in all technical and non-technical courses as well as in management development programmes.
- (f) By recognizing the right of general public as well as of employees to demand and check the enterprise records to help surface the unethical practices.

Factors that Encourage Ethical Practices:

It is commonly held that no nation or community will voluntarily follow the moral values. In order to ensure ethical practices in the society in general and in organizations in particular, a number of facilitating factors ought to be present otherwise unethical practices will prevail. In the following paragraphs, such factors will be briefly described:-

(a) **Public Concern for Unethical Practices.** The very first factor that could encourage ethical practices in a society is concern of common man for ethics. A society, where most of the people tend to accept unethical behaviour as a way of life, is doomed to plunge deeper and deeper into the quagmire of unethical practices. Therefore, even mere awareness of general public and its concern for unethical behaviour would help to make a difference.

(b) **Education.** Mere awareness of people of unethical practices would not be sufficient, rather people would have to be educated in this field. They'll have to be apprised of, for instance,

(i) Necessity of ethics in a society in general and in organizations in particular.

(ii) Advantages of ethical actions and disadvantages of unethical practices.

(iii) Different types of unethical practices and their consequences.

(iv) Need to speak up and curb unethical behaviour at work places.

(v) Difference between legality of a policy, rule, regulation or action and its ethical base.

(c) **Formal Code of Ethics.** In organizations, formulation, publication and implementation of a formal code of ethics will certainly lead to curtailment of unethical actions and encouragement of ethical deeds since people will find it easier to distinguish between ethical or unethical base of any action.

(d) **Right of Information.** Right of information is another factor which serves as a big dissuader to unprincipled employees; therefore, this right should be accepted and implemented. In the presence of this right, unscrupulous employees will be afraid to use unethical means since there will be a real danger of being exposed and penalized.

(e) **Publicity of Unethical Practices.** Unethical practices should be given a wide publicity and be openly condemned so that people are discouraged to resort to such means. An organization should not refrain from such publicity due to fear of bad name to the company. In fact, a number of companies have experienced that their goodwill value improved when they themselves publicized the instances of unethical practices in their rank and file.

(f) **Punishment to Defaulters.** A judicious system of reward and punishment should be established in the organizations so that the defaulters are not let scot-free. Exemplary punishments should be awarded to the defaulters and be given a wide publicity. Such a system would certainly encourage most of the employees to follow the ethical code of conduct.

(g) **Code of Ethics in Islam.** Since theories on ethics may not be comprehensive enough to address various facets of ethics and morality in public affairs, we, as Muslims, should frequently get guidance on ethical questions from the Holy Qur'an, Sunnah and the ethical practices of the first four caliphs. Islamic theory

on ethics also provides a reliable basis to understand various ethical issues. Daily recitation of Holy Qur'an with translation would certainly help us to adopt the highest ethical standards in all walks of life.

END NOTES:

1. Robert M. Fulmer, *The New Management* (Second Edition) [New York: Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc., 1978], p. 435.
2. Ethical Problems of the Association Executives [Washington, D.C.: US Chambers of Commerce, 1972], p.2.
3. Robert Paul Wolff, *About Philosophy* [Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1976], p. 56.
4. Fulmer, op. cit., p. 438.
5. Shah Moin-ud-Din Ahmed Nadvi, *Khulfa-e-Rashdeen* (Urdu Edition) [Karachi: H. M. Saeed Company], p. 40.
6. Ibid, p. 130.
7. Ibid, p. 130.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Fulmer, Robert M., *The New Management* (Second Edition) [New York: Macmillan Publishing Co. Inc., 1978]

Nadvi, Shah Moin-ud-Din Ahmed, *Khulfa-e-Rashdeen* (Urdu Edition) [Karachi: H. M. Saeed Company]

Rauf, Shaikh Abdul, *The Vision* [Rawalpindi: Aleem Publications, 1987]

Tuleja, Thaddeus F., *Beyond the Bottom Line ____ How Business Leaders are Turning Principles into Profits?* [New York: Facts on File Publications, 1985]

Wolff, Robert Paul, *About Philosophy* [Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1976]