

**Educational Factors and Child Trafficking:
Analysis of Survey conducted in Peshawar**
Syed Rashid Ali*, Abdullah**, Nasir Shaheen*** & Imran****

Abstract

Numerous research studies are conducted in different parts of the world to investigate the contributing factors towards child trafficking. The present study is also an attempt to add to the already existing knowledge on the issue with special reference to educational factors. This study is designed with the aim to find out association of educational factors with child trafficking. The study is carried out in Peshawar, the provincial capital of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. A sample of 392 respondents is selected through a stratified random sampling technique from legal experts, crime reporters, and academia. The study shows that lack of educational facilities, ignorance of parents, dropout from schools, harsh attitude of teachers, and passive role of media are associated with child trafficking. Based on our investigation, it is suggested that quality education both general and technical may be initiated for all segments of society without any prejudice and discrimination on the basis of gender, ethnicity, and/or religion.

Keywords: Education, Child trafficking, Peshawar

Introduction

Provision of education is not only essential for the development of individual but it also ensures peaceful and sustainable progress of society.¹ Contrary to this, lack of educational opportunities put children at risk to numerous kinds of social evils including child trafficking.² Studies found that most of the victims of child trafficking were either illiterate or had low level of education as compared to other children.³ It is reported by a number of research

*Syed Rashid Ali, Lecturer, Department of Social Work & Sociology, Kohat University of Science & Technology, Kohat.

**Abdullah, Lecturer, Department of Social Work & Sociology, Kohat University of Science & Technology, Kohat.

***Nasir Shaheen, Assistant Professor, School of Management & Commerce, University of Swat.

****Imran, Lecturer, Institute of Economics, Social and Development Studies, University of Swat.

studies that the children cannot get enrolled or if enrolled leave it before completing any certificate or degree due to financial constrain.⁴ In most of the cases in the under developed countries the poor people do not have access to education due to non-availability of schools in the nearby.⁵ The children of such society that lacks educational opportunities become vulnerable to trafficking. One in seven children, as reported by Wolthuis and Blaak,⁶ worldwide receives no education and lacks opportunity. Girls are seventy percent of this population. This condition of children especially girls make them more susceptible to trafficking.

European Union's Justice and Home Affairs Commission (EJHA)⁷ reported that young girls are more vulnerable to trafficking due to low status of women, poverty and lack of educational opportunities. Contrary to this, children and young girls who have educational opportunities, shelter, food, legal and political system, and secure and protected from physical abuse are less vulnerable to trafficking.

Similarly, Noor Education Trust (NET)⁸ while conducted study on Brides for sale: Internal trafficking nexus at a glance, probed that education was an important factor as far as trafficking was concerned. The study showed that illiterate, uneducated and semi-literate girls are relatively more prone to trafficking as compared to the educated ones. Of the total responses (195), 148 did not reply when asked about their education. This high percentage (76 %) leads us to assume that the victims were illiterate and a response could not be elicited. As most of these girls come from poor communities, they either have no access to education or their parents are so poor that they cannot afford their education. Also relevant here is the fact that priority in education is given to boys in poor families. Approximately 24 percent had some form of early education, primary, middle and secondary level. There were 28 (14.30 %) respondents who had primary education or educated up to class 7.

Study probed the background of the victims with respect to the socio-economic conditions of the family determined that mostly, the parents of the victims of child sex trafficking were reported to be either illiterate or of low level education.⁹ The parents being ignorant of the conditions compromise their children with traffickers for return of certain amount.¹⁰ Nevertheless, most of the poor background children who get chance to enroll in school leave school in early stage. The reasons behind drop out from school are reported to be poverty, lack of interest and ignorance of parents, and the harsh behavior and attitude of teachers.¹¹ Such

children who due to one or other reason left school come on street and the traffickers who are in search cash the opportunity as the families and children are in drastic need of financial support.

The ignorance of parents, society and children is due to the lack of curriculum on the awareness raising regarding the issues of child trafficking which further deteriorate the situation. Along with students and teachers, parents and other community members are to be trained against trafficking.¹² While at the same time, the awareness raising role of media in the present globalized world is indispensable, however, it is observed that instead of launching awareness program the media is involved in glamorizing the world and convincing the immature children and youth that life “over there” is full of facilities and joy. This approach worsened the already risky situation and the traffickers get a chunk of vulnerable people who are themselves ready to be exploited.¹³

The role of media is acknowledged in stemming the issue of child trafficking. Accordingly, through local people in Albania, Bangladesh, Benin, Brazil, Cambodia, Kazakhstan, Liberia, Madagascar, Mali, Moldova, Mongolia, Russia, Serbia and Montenegro, Sri Lanka, Tajikistan, and Ukraine among others, the media was involved to educate community, the most vulnerable population and authorities of different aspect and avenues of human trafficking (USAID).¹⁴ Similar function was undertaken by media in Europe. However, they targeted vulnerable groups, teachers, police, doctors and border guards.¹⁵ However, the role of media performed unintended functions as well. The vulnerable people who got awarded started interest in work abroad. While the girls faced strict restriction from their families due to sensitization.¹⁶ Failure on the part of media to highlight and investigate the issue of trafficking, viewers remain unaware and uninterested.¹⁷

It is not possible to fight child trafficking unless the people are informed and thereby mobilized. Passive role of media creates a serious problem for victims. They became hopeless and could not find the way or support to escape.¹⁸ However, it is also observed that most of the time, due to misunderstanding and/or lack of knowledge media reporters confused child trafficking with other similar offences like human smuggling¹⁹etc.²⁰ due to such misrepresentation the concepts are often used even by lawyers interchangeably.²¹

In a similar way, Tufail Muhammad conducted study for Save the Children on “Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, A Situation Analysis of Pakistan”²² contended that

despite the fact that media is reporting the issues of child sexual abuse which is wide spread in the country. The people wrongly believe the non-existence of such issues in Pakistan which only due to lack of awareness and knowledge. It is proposed that media needs to stop covering this serious issue non-seriously and inadequately.

Research Methodology

The present section explains methodology adopted for carrying out the under discussion study as follows;

Study Area

The present study is conducted in Peshawar, cradle of Pakhtun culture. The incidents of various issues related to child trafficking are likely to be high in this city. The city houses a large population of Afghan refugees who are prone to the child trafficking. Moreover, it has also provided shelter to the internally displaced peoples (IDPs) due to military operation in Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) as a result of war against terrorism. Both of the mentioned groups are prone to child trafficking and other socio-cultural evils. Further, the city hosts the old established academic institutions like Islamia College, University of Peshawar, and University of Agriculture, Peshawar. It also abodes Peshawar press club where journalists are covering every aspect of life in their reporting including crime reporters. A Bench of Supreme court, a full-fledged High court, Special courts, and Peshawar District courts are running its affairs in both its civil and criminal jurisdictions. Due to these specific features, District Peshawar has been selected to investigate the issue.

Sampling Procedure

We tried to approach the victims of trafficking which are handled by Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) at Peshawar. However, we were not given access to the victims due to law prohibiting interaction with the victims. In the absence of information from victims, we approached the social scientists, legal experts, and crime reporters who are the eyes and ears of the society, for their perception of the issue. Moreover, the strata we have used in our sampling is opinion leaders in the particular society and is able to influence the general society, local administration, regional and national legislature, therefore, it is worth knowing about their perception of the issue.

For data collection, sampling method is used by selecting proportionate stratified random sampling technique by using list of membership of local bar council, Peshawar press club, and teachers. This technique deems to be more appropriate for consistent and reliable data. As mentioned, the population is trifurcated into strata like social scientists, crime reporters, and crime practitioners in Peshawar. Against the total population i.e. 453, a sample size of 392 is drawn by using formula $n = \frac{K^2 V^2}{d^2}$ of Casley and Kumar.²³ The calculated sample size is drawn from mentioned strata on the basis of proportional allocation method by using the formula $NI = Ni/N * n$ of Chaudhry and Kamal.²⁴

Data Collection

A comprehensive questionnaire, based on Likert Scale, is developed for data collection. The questionnaire is first discussed with experts and amendments are made accordingly. Thereafter, the questionnaire is pre-tested for its relevance to objectives of the study. Again, the inconsistencies and ambiguities were addressed before starting the final phase of data collection.

Data Analysis

Data was analyzed through Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) computer software. Bi-variate analysis was carried out to measure the level of significance of hypothetical association and direction of relationship between dependent variable (Child trafficking) and independent variables (Economic Position of Family) by using Chi square (χ^2) and Gamma (γ).

Results and Discussion

Undoubtedly, on global level the importance of education is acknowledged for the development of a child. However, in most parts of the world, especially, in poor countries most of the children do not have access to education and if they do, it is not quality education which can ensure better future. Relationship between educational aspect and perception on child trafficking is discussed in this section as follows;

A highly positive ($\gamma=0.693$) and significant ($P<0.05$) relationship is found between lack of educational opportunities and child trafficking. The result suggests that provision of quality education to children might enhance the opportunities and thereby curtails the menace of child trafficking. The findings of the present study are consistent with EUJHAC; NET; and Wolthuis and Blaak.²⁵

Similarly, a highly positive ($\gamma = 0.570$) and significant ($p < 0.05$) relationship is observed between ignorance of guardians and child trafficking (Table 2). The study suggests that the level of capability of guardians/parents is statistically related to the level of existing risks for minor in society. Stronger the guardian lesser would be the risks for child/ward in society and vice versa. The findings of the present study are in accordance with Tumlin & Salah.²⁶

Moreover, a positive ($\gamma = 0.467$) and significant ($p < 0.05$) relationship is found between child trafficking and drop out from schools (Table 2). The study findings suggest that society is recognizing the importance of education which is a positive sign. The government may increase the investment in education to provide access to quality education and work for minimizing the chances of dropout. Similarly, positive ($\gamma = 0.529$) and highly significant ($p < 0.05$) relationship is ascertained between corporal punishment and child trafficking. The findings are in line with Tumlin (2000); Salah (2004).²⁷

Relationship between child trafficking and no proper presentation of issue in the text books is observed to be non significant but positive ($\gamma = 0.220$). The findings of the present study suggest that the attitude towards the incorporation of material on the issue of trafficking in school curriculum is positive which shows its important role in awareness raising among the most vulnerable group of the society i.e., children. On the other hand, it could also be deduced from the findings that society is willing to accept the inclusion of curriculum on child trafficking in school system. This willingness could be due to the existence of high risks and incidence of child trafficking in the region. These findings are analogous with Rafferty.²⁸

A positive ($\gamma = 0.329$) and significant ($p < 0.05$) result exists between role of media and child trafficking (Table 2). The findings suggest that media is not performing its due role of highlighting social issues that could result in obvious awareness in society as a whole. The media may be due to commercialization give time only to such issues that can earn fame and money. In this context, the society feels an obvious and vital role for media as an institution to raise awareness for curbing the menace of child trafficking. These findings are consistent with Hughes (2000); McLoyd (1998); Rafferty (2008); USAID (2006); Rosenberg (2004).²⁹

Table. 2: Relationship between Educational Aspect and Perception on Child Trafficking

Statements	Attitude	Perception on child trafficking			Total	Statistics
		Agree	Disagree	Not sure		
Lack of educational opportunities put child at risk to trafficking.	Agree	291(74.2)	29(7.4)	1(0.3)	321(81.9)	$\chi^2 = 51.46$ (.000) $\gamma = .693$
	Disagree	18(4.6)	16(4.1)	0(0.0)	34(8.7)	
	Not sure	23(5.9)	14(3.6)	0(0.0)	37(9.4)	
Ignorance of parents results in child vulnerability to trafficking.	Agree	287(73.2)	37(9.4)	1(0.3)	325(82.9)	$\chi^2 = 29.14$ (.000) $\gamma = .570$
	Disagree	38(9.7)	13(3.3)	0(.00)	51(13.0)	
	Not sure	7(1.8)	9(2.3)	0(0.0)	16(4.1)	
Drop out from schools turn child in to the hands of traffickers.	Agree	254(64.8)	30(7.7)	1(0.3)	285(72.7)	$\chi^2 = 17.97$ (.001) $\gamma = .467$
	Disagree	47(12.0)	15(3.8)	0(0.0)	62(15.8)	
	Not sure	31(7.9)	14(3.6)	0(0.0)	45(11.5)	
No proper presentation of issue in the text books is also causes trafficking.	Agree	245(62.5)	36(9.2)	1(0.3)	282(71.9)	$\chi^2 = 5.643$ (.227) $\gamma = .220$
	Disagree	47(12.0)	15(3.8)	0(0.0)	62(15.8)	
	Not sure	40(10.2)	8(2.0)	0(0.0)	48(12.2)	
Corporal punishment is responsible for child trafficking.	Agree	195(49.7)	14(3.6)	1(0.3)	210(53.6)	$\chi^2 = 27.78$ (.000) $\gamma = .529$
	Disagree	60(15.3)	15(3.8)	0(0.0)	75(19.1)	
	Not sure	77(19.6)	30(7.7)	0(0.0)	107(27.3)	
The role of media is passive in highlighting the issue of child trafficking.	Agree	247(63.0)	35(8.9)	1(0.3)	283(72.2)	$\chi^2 = 11.44$ (.022) $\gamma = .329$
	Disagree	48(12.2)	8(2.0)	0(0.0)	56(14.2)	
	Not sure	37(9.4)	16(4.1)	0(0.0)	53(13.5)	

Source: Field Survey, 2012

Note*Values presented in the above table indicate frequency while values in the parenthesis represent percentage

Conclusion

The present study aims to investigate association between educational aspect and child trafficking. The study shows that in militancy affected region, lack of educational facilities, ignorance of parents, corporal punishment, dropout of children, no presentation of awareness raising material in school curriculum, and the passive role of media regarding anti-trafficking campaign are associated with and determinants of child trafficking. One of the limitations of the present study is that it does not include

opinion of the victims and their families due to certain ethical, legal, and cultural reasons. We hope that in future there will be a way out to address the mentioned data constraint and we will be able to have in-depth look at the issue which is left for the future research.

Policy Recommendations

We suggest the following recommendations in the light of our findings;

- Quality and compulsory general and technical education up-to graduation is needed for all children without any discrimination on the basis of gender, ethnicity, and/or religion.
- Special adult education program in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa may be initiated to cover those parents who remain illiterate and ignorant.
- There is a need to train teachers in modern methodologies of teaching. Special emphasis may be given to for treating the children in a civilized and nice way.
- Dropout cases may be checked promptly and reasons of it may be overcome on war footing.
- The curriculum of schools and colleges need to be revised and updated. Courses on social issues may be included with the aim to raise awareness.
- Media may be sensitized to help community in presenting the actual position of life away from home.
- Rehabilitative measures by the government in collaboration with the national and international organizations should be initiated which include programs for psychological support and therapy for the vulnerable communities and particularly for the survivors of trafficking.

Notes & References

-
- ¹ Zia ud din, Naseer Ahmed & Muhammad Imran Malik, "Educational Service Delivery System by District Government Peshawar: A Parents' Perspective", *Journal Of Managerial Sciences*, 7:2 (2013): 231-241
- ² Child trafficking refers to means knowingly purchasing, selling, harboring, transporting, providing, detaining or obtaining a child through coercion, kidnapping or abduction, or by giving or receiving any benefit for trafficking him into or out of Pakistan or with intention thereof, for the purpose of exploitative entertainment by any person and receiving or expecting to receive some benefit in lieu thereof (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Child Protection and Welfare Act, 2010)
- ³ Karen C. Tumlin, "Trafficking in Children and Women: A Regional Overview", ILO-IPEC paper, Institute of Asian Studies, Thailand (2000).
- ⁴ M. A. Mirza, "The Menace of Human Trafficking - Pakistan's Response to the Problem?" *Pakistan Journal of Criminology* 2:4 (2010): 151 – 164.
- ⁵ *ibid.*
- ⁶ Wolthuis Annemieke, Blaak Mirjam, "Trafficking in Children for Sexual Purposes from Eastern Europe to Western Europe. An Exploratory Research in Eight Western European Receiving Countries", Ecpat Europe Law Enforcement Group (2001).
- ⁷ EUJHAC stands for European Union Justice and Home Affairs Commission
- ⁸ Noor Education Trust is a non-profit organization working in Peshawar Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan for the promotion and protection of women rights. It conducts research on different customary practices prevailing in Pakhtun society that violates the rights of female.
- ⁹ Karen C. Tumlin, "Trafficking in Children and Women: A Regional Overview", *op.cit.*
- ¹⁰ R. Salah, "Child Trafficking: A Challenge to Child Protection in Africa" paper presented at the Fourth African Regional Conference on Child Abuse and Neglect, Enugu, (2004).
- ¹¹ *ibid*
- ¹² Yvonne Rafferty, "The Impact of Trafficking on Children: Psychological and Social Policy Perspectives", *Child Development Perspectives*, 2:1, (2008): 13–18. Available at: http://thectrp.files.wordpress.com/2008/09/ht_impact_on_children_41081.pdf
- ¹³ Donna M. Hughes, "The Natasha Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women", *Journal of International Affairs*, 53:2, (2000):1-18.
- ¹⁴ US Agency for International Development (USAID), "Trafficking in Persons: USAID's Response", (2006).
- ¹⁵ Ruth Rosenberg, "Best Practices for Programming to Prevent Trafficking in Human Beings in Europe and Eurasia", (Maryland: Development Alternatives, Inc., 2004).

¹⁶ ibid.

¹⁷ Marci McCoy-Roth, "How Social Injustices Fail to Reach the Public Agenda: A Case Study Of Human Trafficking", Conference Papers, *American Political Science Association* (2004): 1-20.

¹⁸ Kamala Kempadoo, *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights* (Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, 2005).

¹⁹ Human Smuggling: means the procurement, in order to obtain, directly, or indirectly, a financial or material benefit, of the illegal entry of a State part of which the person is not a national or permanent resident

²⁰ Janie Chuang, Beyond a Snapshot: Preventing Human Trafficking in the Global Economy, *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies*, 13:1, (2006): 137-163.

²¹ Kinsey Alden Dinan, "Globalization and National Sovereignty: From Migration to Trafficking" in *Trafficking in Humans: Social, Cultural and Political Dimensions*, ed. (Tokyo: Sally Cameron and Edward Newman, 2008): 58-79

²² Tufail Muhammad, "Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, A Situation Analysis of Pakistan", Save the Children (2005). Available at: <http://resourcecentre.savethechildren.se/commercialsexual-exploitation-children-situation-analysis-pakistan>

²³ Casley, D., & Kumar, K. D. The collection, analysis and uses of monitoring and evaluation data. A World Bank Publication. Baltimore: Jhon Hopkins University Press(1989).

²⁴ Sher Muhammad Chaudhry & Shahid Kamal, *Introduction to Statistical Theory Part-II*, 2nd ed. (Lahore: Ilmi KitabKhana, 1996).

²⁵ Wolhuis Annemieke, Blaak Mirjam, "Trafficking in Children for Sexual Purposes from Eastern Europe to Western Europe. An Exploratory Research in Eight Western European Receiving Countries", op.cit.

²⁶ Karen C. Tumlin, "Trafficking in Children and Women: A Regional Overview", op.cit.; R. Salah, "Child Trafficking: A Challenge to Child Protection in Africa", op.cit..

²⁷ ibid

²⁸ Yvonne Rafferty, "The Impact of Trafficking on Children: Psychological and Social Policy Perspectives", op.cit.

²⁹ Donna M. Hughes, "The Natasha Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women", op.cit.